

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

ABERDEEN, 11 June 2024. Minute of Meeting of the NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE. Present:- Councillor Yuill, Convener; Councillor Radley, Vice-Convener; and Councillors Allard (as substitute for Councillor Hutchison from part of article 15 onwards), Ali, Blake, Henrickson, Hutchison (for articles 1 to part of article 15), Massey, Nicoll and van Sweeden.

Also present:- Councillor Bonsell for article 14 and Councillor Mrs Stewart for article 15.

The agenda and reports associated with this minute can be located [here](#).

Please note that if any changes are made to this minute at the point of approval, these will be outlined in the subsequent minute and this document will not be retrospectively altered.

YOUTH CLIMATE CHANGE PRESIDENT

1. The Convener advised that in line with the Committee Terms of Reference, the Youth Climate Change President, Saanvi Kumar, had been due to attend the meeting to participate. He advised that due to preparation for her advanced Highers, she would be unable to participate, however had advised that she would view the meeting webcast. He added that the timing of future invitations could be looked at to avoid any clash with potential study for exams.

DETERMINATION OF EXEMPT BUSINESS

2. The Convener proposed that the Committee consider item 11.7 (Roads and Transport Related Capital Budget Programme 2024/25 – Exempt Appendices) with the press and public excluded from the meeting.

The Committee resolved:-

in terms of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, to exclude the press and public from the meeting during consideration of the above item so as to avoid disclosure of information of the classes described paragraph 8 of Schedule 7(A) to the Act.

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST AND TRANSPARENCY STATEMENTS

3. The following statements of transparency were noted:-

- in relation to items 9.3 (Nature Awareness Campaign); 10.1 (Trees and Woodland) and 10.2 (Open Space Audit Report), Councillor Blake advised that her husband worked for NatureScot, however she did not consider that this connection

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

amounted to an interest which would prevent her from participating in the consideration of those items;

- in relation to items 11.2 (Citywide Implementation of 20mph Speed Limit), 11.4 (Various Small Scale Traffic Management – Stage 3), 11.5 (The Aberdeen City Council (City Centre, Aberdeen) (Traffic Management) (Experimental) Order 2023 – Statutory Public Consultation and 11.6/11.7 (Roads and Transport Related Budget Programme 2024-2025 and exempt appendices), the Convener advised that he was a member of Cycling UK and the AA, however he did not consider that these connections amounted to interest which would prevent him from participating in those items; and
- in relation to item 11.6/11.7 (Roads and Transport Related Budget Programme 2024-2025 and exempt appendices), Councillor Massey advised that he lived on one of the streets which was listed on the reserve list for resurfacing works, however he did not consider that this was an interest which needed to be declared and would prevent him from participating in the item.

MINUTE OF PREVIOUS MEETING OF 27 MARCH 2024 - FOR APPROVAL

4. The Committee had before it the minute of its previous meeting of 27 March 2024 for approval.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the minute as a correct record.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS PLANNER

5. The Committee had before it the business planner, as prepared by the Interim Chief Officer – Governance.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note the verbal update provided on item 7 (Building Energy Efficiency) by the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning, that the building performance policy and standards were currently being updated in accordance with the national standards which had recently been produced, and that a report would be presented to a future meeting on progress and any changes which might be required;
- (ii) also in relation to item 7, to note that the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning would circulate information to Members outwith the meeting on the timeline for the production of the Local Heat & Energy Efficiency Strategy;
- (iii) to note that officers had advised there might be a delay to item 26 (Den Burn Restoration Project), depending on when the results of funding applications were received, as that would affect whether a meaningful update could be provided to Committee in November;

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

- (iv) to agree to remove items 49 (Road Safety Plan 2023-2027), 54 (Wellington Road Multimodal Corridor), 59 (Carbon Budget Monitoring) and 64 (EV Infrastructure Joint Procurement Exercise) for the reasons outlined in the planner; and
- (v) to otherwise note the business planner.

PERFORMANCE REPORT - CORS/24/165

6. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services which presented the status of appropriate key performance measures relating to the services falling within its remit. The report included performance to the end of financial year 2023/24, and it was noted that it therefore reflected the organisational structure in place at the commencement of the 2023/24 reporting year.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee note the report and provide comments and observations on the performance information contained in the report Appendix A.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) in relation to page 36 of the report, and the performance indicator for Sickness Absence - Average Number of Days Lost – Environmental, to note the update provided at the meeting and that the Clerk would circulate the report going to the June Staff Governance Committee on the matter to Net Zero, Environment and Transport Committee members for information;
- (ii) in relation to performance indicators on fleet asset emissions, to note the explanations given at the meeting as to why the target for emissions had a yellow status, despite the fact 94% of the fleet was low emission, and that officers would circulate information to Members outwith the meeting which identified where there had been peaks and troughs in the data and the reasons for this; and
- (iii) to otherwise note the report.

PLACE BASED STRATEGY FRAMEWORK - CR&E/24/160

7. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which provided an update on the development of some of the Council's key place-based strategies.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) note the current position on the preparation of plans and strategies set out in the report, and the indicative timelines provided; and
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to produce an annual Service Update to this Committee on the ongoing development of the plans and strategies set out in the report, noting that this would be in addition to the ongoing reports to Committee on each individual plan and strategy.

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

NATURE AWARENESS CAMPAIGN: PLANS FOR A CITYWIDE COLLABORATION - CR&E/24/164

8. With reference to article 12 of the minute of its meeting of 31 October 2023, the Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which provided an update on plans for a Citywide Nature Awareness Campaign.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) approve the outline Plans for the Citywide Nature Awareness Campaign; and
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to continue working on the Campaign with citywide partners and provide a service update within 12 months of this report.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

TREES AND WOODLAND- CR&E/24/166

9. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which provided an update on the ongoing Council work to Aberdeen's public trees and woodland following the storms of 2021, 2022 and 2023. The report also set out information on Environmental Services' sustainability projects and initiatives undertaken to protect and enhance Aberdeen's public trees and woodlands including the 1 Million Trees initiative and the work to deliver elements of the Tree & Woodland Strategic Implementation Plan. Finally, the report sought approval for Environmental Services to continue to explore funding options, including grants and sponsorship to help fund further tree planting programmes in Aberdeen.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) note and welcome the information contained within this report; and
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer – Operations, to continue to explore funding options, including grants and sponsorship to help fund further tree planting in Aberdeen.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that if Members had any suggestions for green spaces in their Wards which could be considered for any future rewilding or planting, that they should contact the Environmental Manager;

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

- (ii) in relation to the query from Councillor van Sweeden on how the Environmental Service dealt with safety and comfort on tree lined pathways where trees and leaves might fall in poor weather, to note that the Environmental Manager would consider this further and how this could be built in to the work his team was undertaking in such spaces in the city;
- (iii) to note that the Environmental Manager would provide information to Members outwith the meeting on whether the planting of gorse would have impact on any other species;
- (iv) to note that the Environmental Manager would present a report to a future Committee on tree planting in respect of the objective to plant one million trees between 2022 and 2032; and
- (v) to approve the recommendations.

OPEN SPACE AUDIT REPORT - CR&E/24/162

10. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which sought approval for the draft Aberdeen Open Space Audit Reports 2024, under the requirements of The Planning (Scotland) Act 2019 which required planning authorities to carry out an audit of existing open space provision in their local authority area.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee -

- (a) approve the content of the draft Aberdeen Open Space Audit 2024: Main and Public Survey Reports;
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to finalise the reports (including minor corrections, formatting and inclusion of remaining Ward and Theme information following the examples shown on pages 34 and 50 in the main report), circulate these finalised reports via a service update to Net Zero, Environment and Transport Committee Members and publish them on the Council’s website;
- (c) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning following consultation with the Chief Officer - Data Insights to publish the Open Space Audit geographic information system (GIS) mapping on the Council’s website;
- (d) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to explore options for the development of an ArcGIS StoryMap version of the findings of the Aberdeen Open Space Audit reports; and
- (e) instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to proactively promote the reports and findings with relevant stakeholders, including our communities.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that officers would circulate information to Members outwith the meeting on the number of public toilets in Aberdeen and their location;

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

- (ii) to note that Kingswells had been omitted from the tree equity index and canopy cover and that officers had contacted the company that had undertaken the data collection to ascertain why that was;
- (iii) also in relation to the above, to note that officers would ascertain whether the inclusion of Kingswells would improve the figure of 8% in the Kingswells, Sheddocksley and Summerhill ward; and
- (iv) to approve the recommendations.

ABERDEEN RAPID TRANSIT - RECOMMENDED NETWORK ROUTEING - CR&E/24/161

11. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which presented recommendations in relation to the desired routes for the proposed Aberdeen Rapid Transit (ART) network in order to enable further progression of the Strategic Business Case.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) note the findings of the Aberdeen Rapid Transit (ART) Routeing Appraisal, as presented in Appendix 1;
- (b) note the views of the North East Bus Alliance on the proposed ART routes, as highlighted at 3.19 of the report;
- (c) agree the proposed ART routes as outlined at Figure 1 and 3.8-3.18 to be the desired network upon which to continue to develop the business case for ART;
- (d) agree that the multi-modal corridor studies be concluded at the end of Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG) Detailed Options Appraisal and that the bus priority infrastructure options that align with the agreed ART routes as identified at (iii) above, be incorporated within the overall ART Business Case development process, as illustrated at Figure 2, rather than continue as standalone projects;
- (e) to agree that those actions identified in the Multi-Modal Corridor Studies that do not align with the proposed ART network be progressed through separate workstreams as appropriate;
- (f) to instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to report back to this Committee on the ART Strategic Business Case by the end of the 2024/25 financial year, including further exploration of the costs and risks associated with both a Bus Service Improvement Partnership (BSIP) and Franchise approach, and prior to moving to Outline Business Case;
- (g) to instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to engage with bus operators, through the North East Bus Alliance, on the options for delivery of ART along these desired routes through a partnership approach; and
- (h) to instruct the Chief Officer – Strategic Place Planning to undertake further engagement, as appropriate, with the public and stakeholders on the development of ART to inform the Strategic Business Case, encompassing and superseding previously agreed actions for engagement on the individual corridors, and

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

therefore enabling future engagement to be better aligned and set within the context of the wider ART vision and programme.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

CITYWIDE IMPLEMENTATION OF 20MPH SPEED LIMIT - CR&E/24/139

12. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which provided information on the outcome of a citywide assessment carried out by a consultant on behalf of Aberdeen City Council, in line with the Scottish Government's National Strategy for 20mph, and sought approval for the implementation of 20mph on roads that had been identified to meet the Scottish Government's criteria.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) acknowledge the Scottish Government's National Strategy for 20 mph in urban areas; and
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to promote the Traffic Regulation Orders (TRO)/Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders (TTRO) necessary for the introduction and implementation of 20mph on the roads identified in Appendix 2 of the report. Any objections received would be reported back to this Committee for consideration, otherwise the TRO would be made and the measures implemented.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that there was an error in section 3.8(a) of the report and the figure should read 100m, rather than 10m;
- (ii) to note that officers had provided information to Transport Scotland on the expected cost of implementation, and would provide this information to Members outwith the meeting;
- (iii) to note that the Convener and Vice Convener had undertaken to write to the Scottish Government, the Chief Constable, and the Crown Office Procurator Fiscal in relation to the Council's concerns about enforcement of the 20mph speed limit;
- (iv) to acknowledge the Scottish Government's National Strategy for 20 mph in urban areas;
- (v) to instruct the Chief Officer – Operations to promote the Traffic Regulation Orders (TRO) for 20mph of those streets located within residential areas identified in Appendix 2 and on conclusion of the TRO process, with or without objections, report back to this Committee for consideration prior to implementation;
- (vi) to instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to report back to this Committee those streets, identified in Appendix 2, meeting the place criteria or linking sections of roads meeting the place criteria, which would encourage a more consistent

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

reduction in speed across a wider area, that could be made 20mph under Temporary Traffic Regulation Orders (TTRO), reporting the results of an informal public consultation process; and

- (vii) to instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to bring back a report to this Committee, working with Police Scotland, in 24 months on the impact and enforcement on vehicle speeds on the roads where 20mph has been introduced.

IMPLEMENTATION OF PAVEMENT PARKING PROHIBITION - CR&E/24/140

13. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which sought approval for the implementation of pavement parking prohibition, double parking, and parking at dropped kerbs, in Aberdeen and permission to proceed with an exemption process for the identified streets listed in section 3.5 of the report.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) acknowledge the Scottish Government's directive to local authorities regarding the pavement parking, double parking and parking at dropped kerbs prohibitions;
- (b) authorise officers (whether City Wardens, officers in the Parking and Bus Lane Appeals Team or other officers) to undertake, arrange to be undertaken, authorise and instruct, all activity relating to parking enforcement (including but not limited to enforcement of pavement parking, double parking and parking at dropped kerbs) in terms of the Transport (Scotland) Act 2019 and the Parking Prohibitions (Enforcement and Accounts) (Scotland) Regulations 2023, excluding streets that are to be exempted from the pavement parking prohibition;
- (c) instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to remove existing signs in relation to existing pavement parking bans; and
- (d) instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to undertake the Traffic Regulation Order (TRO) process necessary for the exemption of the streets listed in section 3.5 of the report from the pavement parking prohibition and report back to this Committee any objections received. If no objections were received, the TRO should be made, and the exemptions implemented on site.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that there was an error in the report at section 3.5 where the ward for Great Northern Road was listed incorrectly as Airyhall/Broomhill/Garthdee, however the map appended to the report did show the correct location;
- (ii) to note that officers would ascertain whether Edinburgh City Council had required to increase the number of wardens to implement the enforcement of pavement parking, and if so, whether they had utilised the funding source for additional wardens, and would circulate this information to Members outwith the meeting; and
- (iii) to approve recommendations (a) to (d), with the addition of (e) to instruct the Chief Officer – Operations to report to this Committee no later than July 2025 on the

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

operation of the pavement parking prohibition and to make any necessary recommendations arising from that.

VARIOUS SMALL SCALE TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT - STAGE 3 - CR&E/24/168

14. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which set out objections and comments received as part of the statutory consultation process with respect to proposed Traffic Regulation Orders (TROs).

In terms of Standing Order 16.1, Councillor Bonsell attended the meeting and asked a number of questions of officers in respect of the report.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) acknowledge the objections received as a result of the public advertisement of proposed Traffic Regulation Orders;
- (b) in relation to “THE ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (A92 North Anderson Drive, Aberdeen) Prohibition of Right Turns) Order 202(X)” overrule the objection received and approve this order be made as originally advertised;
- (c) in relation to “The ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (Cove Road- Extension of prohibition of waiting at any time restrictions Order 202(X)” overrule the objection received and approve this order be made as originally advertised;
- (d) in relation to “THE ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (Abergeldie Road & Braemar place–proposed lengths of prohibition of waiting at any time.) (TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT) ORDER 202X” overrule the objection received and approve this order be made as originally advertised;
- (e) in relation to “THE ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (Milltimber Brae proposed 40mph speed limit) (TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT) ORDER 202X” overrule the objection received and approve this order be made as originally advertised; and
- (f) in relation to “THE ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (Hazeldene/Pinewood proposed 20mph speed limit) (TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT) ORDER 202X” overrule the objection received and approve this order be made as originally advertised.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the recommendations.

THE ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL (CITY CENTRE, ABERDEEN) (TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT) (EXPERIMENTAL) ORDER 2023 - STATUTORY PUBLIC CONSULTATION - CR&E/24/169

15. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which set out the objections and comments received

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

during the consultation process for “The Aberdeen City Council (City Centre, Aberdeen) (Traffic Management) (Experimental) Order 2023”.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) note the benefits highlighted, to date, by the bus operators, and recognise the measures would support continuing improvements. Similarly, noting the measures supported active travel by way of walking or cycling. Collectively, the measures were a vital component of the City Centre Masterplan for establishing an attractive and vibrant city centre, with an environment that was conducive to encouraging footfall. Furthermore, choice remained in terms of access, with car parks and on-street parking capacity unaffected, and a network of appropriate distributor roads available, whether for access or through traffic;
- (b) approve the making of “The Aberdeen City Council (City Centre, Aberdeen) (Traffic Management) Experimental Order 2023” as a permanent Order, albeit with continued monitoring in terms of the ongoing City Centre Masterplan; and
- (c) instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to commence the procedure for the Order to be made permanent.

Members asked a number of questions of officers.

In accordance with Standing Order 16.1, Councillor Mrs Stewart addressed the meeting and spoke against the recommendations in the report.

The Convener, seconded by the Vice Convener, moved:-

That the Committee:-

- (a) agree the recommendations subject to (b) and (c) below;
- (b) in the context of the ongoing construction works on Union Street and around the New Market development, instruct the Chief Officer - Operations to introduce a Temporary Traffic Regulation Order (TTRO) to suspend the Bus Gates on Union Street (westbound only) / Market Street (southbound only), between its junctions with Adelphi and Hadden Street; this allowing all classes of vehicle to turn left from Union Street onto Market Street, thereafter restricting general traffic to a left only turn at the bottom of Market Street onto Trinity Quay (Virginia Street), this to aid continued access and servicing of the businesses on Market Street and Shiprow throughout the remaining period of construction;
- (c) instruct the Chief Officer – Operations to report to this Committee in 18 months’ time on the operation and impact of this city centre traffic management regime and to make any recommendations for modifications he considers appropriate.

Councillor Ali, seconded by Councillor Blake, moved as an amendment:-

That the Committee:-

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

- (a) notes that in 2016 the Labour led administration brought forward the City Centre Masterplan, which was agreed unanimously by all political parties;
- (b) notes the Masterplan document speaks about pedestrian(s) and pedestrianisation 73 times within the document and mentions Bus Gates twice;
- (c) agrees that the Masterplan document was designed with people in mind and that Bus Gates would be installed at key intersections on the periphery of the city centre to ensure buses are not impacted by congestion during weekday peak hours;
- (d) agrees that decisions taken by the SNP administration risk turning Aberdeen Union Street into a ghost town;
- (e) agrees businesses right across the city are angry and disappointed with the SNP Administration at Aberdeen City Council for killing footfall in our city by introducing bus gates without actually introducing pedestrianisation of the central part of Union Street;
- (f) agrees that pedestrianisation of the central section of Union Street is the way forward for our city; and
- (g) instructs the Chief Officer - Operations to report back on the rescinding of The Aberdeen City Council (City Centre, Aberdeen) (Traffic Management) Experimental Order 2023, including financial impact, and report back to Full Council.

On a division, there voted:- for the motion (6) – the Convener; the Vice Convener; and Councillors Allard, Henrickson, Nicoll and van Sweeden; for the amendment (3) – Councillors Ali, Blake and Massey.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that officers would investigate whether data was available for Council-run car parks to show if there had been any drop in uptake of parking;
- (ii) to note that officers would provide information to Members outwith the meeting in relation to footfall data from other cities, and the comparison with Aberdeen;
- (iii) to note that officers would contact Police Scotland to ask if there had been an increase in anti-social behaviour in the city centre since last summer and the closure of Union Street to general traffic, and to further note that a report was due to the next meeting of Communities, Housing and Public Protection Committee on this issue; and
- (iv) in relation to the query as to how many people were now travelling into the city centre on public transport, including the number of people going in and out of the bus station, to note that officers would contact Stagecoach and First Group to ask if more detailed data could be provided on this; and
- (v) to adopt the motion.

In terms of Standing Order 34.1, Councillor Ali intimated that he would like this matter to be referred to full Council in order for a final decision to be taken. He was supported in this regard by Councillors Blake and Massey.

NET ZERO, ENVIRONMENT AND TRANSPORT COMMITTEE

11 June 2024

At this juncture, the Convener proposed that the Committee suspend Standing Order 40.2 (Length of Meetings) to enable the meeting to continue beyond six hours. The Committee agreed unanimously to suspend Standing Order 40.2.

ROADS AND TRANSPORT RELATED BUDGET PROGRAMME 2024 - 2025 (ANNUAL REPORT) - CR&E/24/167

16. The Committee had before it a report by the Executive Director of City Regeneration and Environment which set out the proposed Roads and Transportation programme for the approved 2024/2025 capital budgets, and sought approval for the schemes detailed in the report and associated appendices.

The report recommended:-

that the Committee –

- (a) approve the schemes listed in the appendices as the detailed proposals for expenditure within each budget heading; and
- (b) instruct the Chief Officer - Operations, following consultation with the Head of Commercial and Procurement Service, to undertake or instruct appropriate procedures in accordance with the Council's procurement regulations to procure the works referred to in the exempt appendices for the roads capital budget programme for the financial year 2024/25 and award contracts relating thereto.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note that officers would follow up on Councillor Nicoll's query in relation to works which had been due to happen in Midstocket and which were now on the reserve list in the report; and
- (ii) to approve the recommendations.

In accordance with the decision taken under article 2, the following item was considered with the press and public excluded.

ROADS AND TRANSPORT RELATED BUDGET PROGRAMME 2024 - 2025 EXEMPT APPENDIX

17. The Committee had before it an exempt appendix relating to the Roads and Transport Related Budget Programme 2024-2025 report (Article 16 of this minute refers).

The Committee resolved:-

to note the information contained with the exempt appendices.

- **COUNCILLOR IAN YUILL, Convener**